

## MEMORANDUM

TO: Francine Lawrence, President, Toledo Federation of Teachers  
Carol Thomas, Executive Assistant to the Superintendent for Human Resources,  
Toledo Public Schools

FROM: Timothy Daly, President, The New Teacher Project

DATE: February 8, 2010

CC: Daniel Weisberg, The New Teacher Project

RE: Reconciliation of TPS teacher dismissal data

---

Thank you for your patience and assistance during our recent efforts to reconcile newly available data on teacher dismissals in Toledo Public Schools (TPS) with the dismissal data published in our June 2009 report *The Widget Effect: Our National Failure to Acknowledge and Act on Differences in Teacher Effectiveness*. We have concluded our review of the data on Peer Assistance and Review (PAR) outcomes from the TFT-TPS Intern Program office, which TFT shared with us in October 2009. This memorandum provides an overview of the reconciliation process and a summary of our findings.

### TIMELINE

The following timeline summarizes TNTP's process to obtain and verify data on the number of non-tenured and tenured TPS teachers who were dismissed due to performance concerns during the school years 2003-04 through 2007-08.

- **September 9, 2008** - TNTP sent a request for extant data on teacher assignment, separation, contract status and evaluation for school years 2003-04 through 2007-08 to TPS Human Resources (HR).
- **September 17, 2008 to October 3, 2008** - TPS HR provided TNTP with extant data on teacher assignment, separation and contract status for school years 2003-04 through 2007-08. TPS HR did not provide teacher evaluation data at this time, as it was unavailable in electronic format.
- **January 21, 2009** - TPS HR provided TNTP with photocopies of teacher evaluation records from school years 2003-04 through 2007-08.
- **March 9, 2009** - TNTP sent a request for extant data on teacher interventions and dismissals for school years 2003-04 through 2007-08 to TFT. TNTP followed up with TFT on April 6, 2009, to ask when the data would be made available.



## The New Teacher Project

- April 15, 2009** – TNTP sent a memo to TFT and TPS summarizing the results of TNTP’s analysis of the teacher assignment, separation, contract status and evaluation data that TPS HR provided, and asked TFT and TPS to review and confirm the reporting of the data. TNTP indicated that if no response was received by April 22, 2009, TNTP would assume that TFT and TPS agreed with the data contained in the memo. No response was received.
- April 28, 2009** – TFT provided TNTP with data from the TPS-TFT Intern Program office showing 48 teachers who were in the PAR intern or intervention program during school years 2004-05 through 2007-08. However, TNTP staff did not have enough information to interpret this data or link it to data provided by TPS HR. TNTP followed up with TFT on April 29, 2009 to clarify the data. No response was received despite several follow-up attempts from TNTP staff.
- June 1, 2009** – TNTP released *The Widget Effect, Our National Failure to Acknowledge and Act on Differences in Teacher Effectiveness*, which reported five dismissals of non-tenured teachers for performance concerns and one dismissal of a tenured teacher for performance concerns in TPS during school years 2003-04 through 2007-08. TFT contacted TNTP with concerns about the accuracy of the data. TNTP agreed to work with TFT on a careful examination of the data to reach a conclusion about final figures.
- July 31, 2009** – TFT faxed the following table of figures breaking out non-renewals, terminations and resignations for school years 2004-05 through 2008-09. TNTP asked for additional information for data reconciliation purposes, such as the identities of individuals included in the tallies and subtotals for tenured and non-tenured teachers. TFT agreed to supply a full list of teachers.

School Year	Non-renewal	Termination	Resignation
2004-05	2		
2005-06	4	2	
2006-07	2	3	
2007-08	1	1	4
2008-09	11	4	6

- October 9, 2009** – TFT provided TNTP with a new summary (below) of PAR outcome data from the TPS-TFT Intern Program office for school years 2004-05 through 2007-08. On October 11, TFT provided TNTP with detailed PAR outcome data from the Intern Program office for school years 2004-05 through 2007-08, including teacher names and PAR outcome dates.

School Year	Interns Total #	-Interns- Non Renewed/Terminated/ Resigned		Interventions Ongoing	Interventions Concluded	
		Number	Percentage		Positive	Negative
2004-05	134	6	4.5%	2	2	2
2005-06	69	5	7.2%	1	1	0
2006-07	69	2	2.9%	1	0	2
2007-08	98	9	9.2%	6	0	1
2008-09	124	16	12.9%	8	1	7

- **October 11, 2009 to October 21, 2009** – TNTP compared the PAR outcome data with the teacher assignment, separation and contract status data received from the TPS HR in October 2008. Through this comparison, TNTP identified 138 records from the PAR outcome data that did not reconcile with the data provided by TPS HR in October 2008.
- **October 22, 2009** – In a conference call, TNTP staff reviewed the 138 unreconciled PAR outcome records with Carol Thomas, TPS Executive Assistant to the Superintendent for Human Resources, and Francine Lawrence, TFT President. Ms. Thomas agreed to have TPS HR staff manually look up each of the unreconciled records to fill in the missing details.
- **December 16, 2009** – TPS HR provided TNTP with detailed teacher assignment, separation and contract status data for the 138 unreconciled PAR outcome records. TNTP staff used these data to complete final reconciliation of the PAR outcome data. TNTP identified two additional dismissals of non-tenured teachers for performance concerns that should have been included in the data reported in *The Widget Effect*.
- This winter, TNTP will issue a reprint of *The Widget Effect* including an adjusted total of seven formal dismissals of non-tenured TPS teachers for performance concerns during school years 2003-04 through 2007-08. The reprint will also include footnotes citing the number of informal dismissals of non-tenured and tenured TPS teachers over the same time period. (Note: Informal dismissals were not tracked for other districts included in *The Widget Effect* because those districts did not keep records on resignations influenced by performance.)

### SUMMARY OF RECONCILED DATA

The tables below summarize the number of TPS teacher dismissals between school years 2003-04 and 2007-08 from three sources: 1) the data reported in the original printing of *The Widget Effect* in June 2009; 2) the data on PAR outcomes from the TPS-TFT Intern Program office that TFT provided in October 2009; and 3) the final reconciled data on teacher dismissals that will appear in the reprint of *The Widget Effect* this winter. In general, there are two ways in which the final reconciled data set differs from the PAR outcome data:

- Eleven formal or informal dismissals in the PAR outcome data were teachers who were long-term substitutes at the time of their participation in PAR.<sup>1</sup> *The Widget Effect* examined only full-time classroom teachers. For this reason, substitutes are excluded from the final reconciled data set but are reported separately here for reference.
- One long-term substitute was double-counted in the PAR outcome data after being dismissed twice.

---

<sup>1</sup> The official term for this group of teachers is “part-time long term substitutes.” Although these teachers participate in PAR when they have been in the same assignment for 60 days or more, they are not official teachers of record and are not guaranteed an ongoing position in the district.

*Figure 1: Formal Dismissals of Non-tenured Teachers*

School year	June 2009 printing of <i>The Widget Effect</i>	PAR outcome data from October 2009	TNTP final reconciled data set: Full-time classroom teachers (to be published in the winter 2010 reprint of <i>The Widget Effect</i> )
2003-04	2	N/A	2
2004-05	1	4	1
2005-06	2	5	3
2006-07	0	2	0
2007-08	0	4	1
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>15</b>	<b>7</b>

*Figure 2: Formal Dismissals of Tenured Teachers*

School year	June 2009 printing of <i>The Widget Effect</i>	PAR outcome data from October 2009	TNTP final reconciled data set: Full-time classroom teachers (to be published in the winter 2010 reprint of <i>The Widget Effect</i> )
2003-04	0	N/A	0
2004-05	0	0	0
2005-06	0	0	0
2006-07	1	0	1
2007-08	0	0	0
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>

*Figure 3: Informal Dismissals of Non-tenured Teachers*

School year	June 2009 printing of <i>The Widget Effect</i>	PAR outcome data from October 2009	TNTP final reconciled data set: Full-time classroom teachers (to be published in a footnote in the winter 2010 reprint of <i>The Widget Effect</i> )
2003-04	N/A	N/A	N/A
2004-05		2	1
2005-06		0	0
2006-07		0	0
2007-08		5	4
<b>TOTAL</b>		<b>7</b>	<b>5</b>

*Figure 4: Informal Dismissals of Tenured Teachers*

School year	June 2009 printing of <i>The Widget Effect</i>	PAR outcome data from October 2009	TNTP final reconciled data set: Full-time classroom teachers (to be published in a footnote in the winter 2010 reprint of <i>The Widget Effect</i> )
2003-04	N/A	N/A	N/A
2004-05		2	2
2005-06		0	0
2006-07		2	2
2007-08		1	1
<b>TOTAL</b>		<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>

Figure 5: Summary of PAR Outcome Data vs. TNTP Final Reconciled Data, 2003-04 through 2007-08

Data source	# of teachers
PAR outcome data: Formal dismissals of non-tenured teachers, 2004-05 through 2007-08	15
Mismatched records	
o Long-term substitute teachers	(-9)
o Teacher who was double counted in PAR outcome data after being dismissed twice	(-1)
Dismissals from 2003-04*	(+2)
<b>TNTP final reconciled data:</b> Formal dismissals of non-tenured, full-time, classroom teachers	<b>7</b>
TFT data: Formal dismissals of tenured teachers	0
Mismatched records	
o Teacher who is recorded in TPS HR data as a formal dismissal of a tenured teacher but does not appear in the PAR outcome data	(+1)
<b>TNTP final reconciled data:</b> Formal dismissals of tenured, full-time, classroom teachers	<b>1</b>
PAR outcome data: Informal dismissals of non-tenured teachers	7
Mismatched records	
o Long-term substitute teachers	(-2)
<b>TNTP final reconciled data:</b> Informal dismissals of non-tenured, full-time, classroom teachers	<b>5</b>
PAR outcome data: Informal dismissals of tenured teachers	5
Mismatched records	
o None	---
<b>TNTP final reconciled data:</b> Informal dismissals of tenured, full-time, classroom teachers	<b>5</b>

\* Data from 2003-04 was not part of the TPS-TFT Intern Program data set sent to TNTP in fall 2009. This figure is based on data received from Toledo Public Schools' Human Resources office.